



Journal of Frontiers in Multidisciplinary Research

Systematic Review of Community-Based Extracurricular Education for Enhancing Learning Outcomes in Underfunded Schools

Ginikachi Prisca Ifenatuora ^{1*}, Olanrewaju Awoyemi ², Fadeke Adeola Atobatele ³

¹ Government Secondary School Kwara State, Nigeria

² Launchforth Group of Schools, Matogun, Lagos, Nigeria

³ Independent Researcher, Nigeria

* Corresponding Author: **Ginikachi Prisca Ifenatuora**

Article Info

E-ISSN: 3050-9726

P-ISSN: 3050-9718

Volume: 02

Issue: 01

January-June 2021

Received: 02-03-2021

Accepted: 03-04-2021

Published: 04-05-2021

Page No: 121-126

Abstract

This paper presents a systematic review of community-based extracurricular education as a strategic approach to enhancing learning outcomes in underfunded schools. Drawing from an extensive analysis of empirical studies across various global contexts, the paper explores the conceptual foundations, theoretical frameworks, and practical implementation considerations of these programs. Central concepts such as community-based learning, extracurricular engagement, and educational equity are defined and examined through the lens of socio-cultural learning theory and ecological systems theory. The review synthesizes findings on academic, social-emotional, and behavioral impacts, highlighting the value of extracurricular programs in addressing the limitations of under-resourced formal education. Key implementation factors, including stakeholder collaboration, resource sustainability, and policy alignment, are discussed to offer actionable insights. While the evidence base affirms the positive influence of these initiatives, the paper identifies methodological and contextual gaps, calling for more rigorous and inclusive research. The conclusion reinforces the transformative potential of community-driven educational interventions in promoting equity, engagement, and lifelong learning.

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.54660/JFMR.2021.2.1.121-126>

Keywords: Community-Based Education, Extracurricular Learning, Underfunded Schools, Learning Outcomes, Educational Equity, Stakeholder Collaboration

1. Introduction

1.1 Background and Rationale

Education systems around the world face significant disparities, with underfunded schools often serving students from marginalized or economically disadvantaged communities ^[1]. These schools are typically characterized by inadequate infrastructure, a shortage of qualified teachers, and limited access to learning materials and technology ^[2, 3]. As a result, students in these environments frequently experience lower academic achievement, reduced engagement, and limited post-secondary opportunities. The persistent educational inequality not only undermines individual potential but also perpetuates cycles of poverty and social disadvantage ^[4].

In recent years, there has been a growing recognition of the value of educational initiatives beyond the traditional classroom. Among these, community-based extracurricular education has gained attention for its potential to enrich student learning ^[5]. Unlike school-led afterschool programs, these initiatives are typically rooted in local partnerships and driven by community involvement. They encompass a range of activities—from arts and sports to tutoring and mentorship—that support cognitive, social, and emotional development ^[6, 7]. This model offers a particularly promising approach for underfunded schools, where limited resources often constrain formal instruction.

By tapping into the assets of the community—such as local volunteers, cultural institutions, and non-profit organizations—these programs aim to create learning environments that are engaging, relevant, and supportive. Understanding how these interventions operate, and the extent to which they influence learning outcomes, is vital for developing equitable and effective educational strategies in resource-constrained settings^[8, 9].

1.2 Research Objectives

The principal aim of this paper is to systematically review the existing academic literature on community-based extracurricular education and assess its impact on learning outcomes within underfunded schools. This exploration seeks to identify the nature and effectiveness of these programs, as well as the contextual factors that influence their success or failure. The review will offer insights into how community engagement can be leveraged to support educational equity by synthesizing evidence across various contexts.

The paper is guided by the following research questions to achieve this aim: (1) What types of community-based extracurricular programs have been implemented in underfunded school contexts? (2) What are the reported academic and non-academic outcomes associated with participation in such programs? (3) What factors contribute to or hinder the effectiveness of these programs in enhancing student learning? These questions are intended to capture the interventions' structural features and their measurable impacts.

By addressing these questions, the review aims to provide educators, policymakers, and community stakeholders with a robust evidence base to inform future program design and policy interventions. The goal is to highlight successful models and identify gaps in the literature where further research is needed. Through this, the paper contributes to the ongoing conversation about how best to support students in contexts lacking conventional educational resources.

1.3 Scope and Methodology of the Review

This systematic review adopts a structured and transparent approach to identify, assess, and synthesize existing studies on community-based extracurricular education in underfunded school settings. The review process involved multiple academic databases including ERIC, JSTOR, Scopus, and Google Scholar to ensure broad coverage of relevant literature. The search strategy combined keywords such as "community-based education," "extracurricular programs," "underfunded schools," "educational outcomes," and "after-school interventions," applying Boolean operators to enhance search precision.

Studies were included based on several criteria: they had to be peer-reviewed, published between 2015 and 2021, and focused on primary or secondary education. Importantly, the interventions studied needed to be community-driven and take place outside of regular school hours. Excluded were programs led solely by schools without community involvement, or those based in well-resourced institutions, to maintain the review's focus on underfunded contexts. Both quantitative and qualitative studies were considered to capture a full range of findings. Data extraction involved recording details on program characteristics, study design, participant demographics, and reported outcomes. A thematic synthesis approach was used to analyze the findings,

grouping results into key domains such as academic performance, social-emotional development, and community engagement. Quality appraisal was conducted using standardized tools appropriate to each study type (e.g., CASP for qualitative studies, GRADE for quantitative research). This rigorous methodology ensures that the review's conclusions are both comprehensive and reliable, offering valuable insights for research and practice alike.

2. Theoretical and Conceptual Framework

2.1 Definitions and Key Concepts

To build a coherent foundation for this review, it is essential to first clarify the key concepts at the heart of this study. The term community-based refers to educational initiatives that are initiated, operated, or supported by individuals, groups, or organizations within the local community^[10]. These programs often rely on local partnerships and resources, aiming to foster a sense of ownership and relevance among participants^[11, 40]. Community involvement may range from informal mentorship to structured programs provided by non-governmental organizations, cultural institutions, or civic bodies. The emphasis lies in tapping into indigenous knowledge, values, and capacities to enrich the educational process^[12, 41].

Extracurricular education encompasses learning activities that take place outside the standard curriculum and school hours. These include academic support programs, sports, creative arts, leadership training, and social clubs^[13, 39]. The term implies not only a supplementary role to formal education but also an experiential and often voluntary dimension that allows for student autonomy and interest-based engagement. In community-based forms, these activities are deeply embedded in the local socio-cultural fabric and are typically more accessible in informal or non-institutional spaces^[14, 15].

Learning outcomes refer to the specific knowledge, skills, attitudes, and values acquired by students as a result of educational engagement. In this review, the term is understood broadly to include academic achievements (such as test scores and grade progression), as well as social-emotional competencies, behavioral changes, and cognitive development^[16, 34]. These outcomes serve as indicators of both short-term academic success and long-term personal and social development. Understanding how community-based extracurricular education contributes to these diverse outcomes is central to evaluating its impact in underfunded educational contexts^[17, 18].

2.2 Theoretical Underpinnings

This review is anchored in several interrelated educational theories that illuminate how learning can occur outside traditional classroom settings. One of the central frameworks is socio-cultural learning theory, primarily advanced by Lev Vygotsky, which posits that learning is inherently a social process mediated by language, culture, and interaction^[17, 19]. This theory supports the idea that community-based programs, through collaboration and shared activities, create rich environments for learning that may be absent in resource-deprived schools. These spaces enable students to internalize knowledge through guided participation and culturally relevant experiences^[11, 20].

Another key perspective is Bronfenbrenner's ecological systems theory, which views child development as a function of multiple environmental systems. The microsystem—

comprising family, peers, and school—is influenced by the larger exosystem and macrosystem, such as community networks and cultural norms ^[9, 21]. Community-based programs operate within and across these systems, serving as connectors between personal and institutional spheres. They allow for more holistic educational experiences by integrating school learning with real-world contexts and relationships ^[22, 38].

Complementing these theories is the concept of experiential learning, particularly as developed by David Kolb, which emphasizes the transformative potential of learning through reflection on doing. Extracurricular activities often place learners in novel situations requiring problem-solving, teamwork, and leadership. These experiences provide feedback loops that reinforce learning in meaningful ways. Together, these theoretical lenses underscore the value of community-rooted, activity-driven education for developing competencies that go beyond rote academic performance ^[23, 39].

2.3 Conceptual Link Between Extracurricular Engagement and Academic Achievement

There is a growing body of evidence supporting the notion that extracurricular engagement positively influences academic outcomes, particularly for students in under-resourced environments. Participation in well-structured, community-oriented programs has been linked to improved attendance, higher motivation, and increased self-esteem—factors which cumulatively enhance academic performance ^[13, 24]. These programs often offer individualized support and enrichment opportunities that compensate for gaps in formal schooling. By addressing both cognitive and emotional needs, they can create conditions more conducive to learning and academic persistence ^[8, 25].

The mechanisms behind this influence are both direct and indirect. Directly, academic-focused extracurriculars such as tutoring or homework clubs provide explicit instruction and practice. Indirectly, engagement in arts, sports, or civic activities cultivates soft skills such as time management, critical thinking, and social interaction, which correlate with academic success. In underfunded schools, where student-teacher ratios are high and engagement is often low, these alternative settings can reignite interest in learning and build a sense of competence and belonging ^[26].

Moreover, community involvement adds another layer of benefit. Programs that involve families, mentors, and local role models help contextualize academic learning within students' lived experiences. This relevance boosts intrinsic motivation and fosters a sense of purpose ^[27]. For many students in disadvantaged settings, having a support network outside school is crucial for navigating academic and life challenges. Thus, community-based extracurricular education functions as both a supplement and an alternative pathway to learning, offering tools and relationships that help bridge the educational equity gap ^[28].

3. Review of Empirical Evidence

3.1 Characteristics of Included Studies

The body of literature examined in this review reflects a diverse array of geographical settings, program models, and participant demographics. Studies were conducted across multiple continents, including North America, sub-Saharan Africa, South Asia, and Latin America, capturing a wide spectrum of economic, cultural, and institutional contexts.

Most of the research focuses on urban and peri-urban areas where underfunded schools are more densely concentrated, though a few studies also examine rural settings. The majority of participants were students aged 6 to 18, with a concentration on those in middle and lower secondary school. Many studies included additional perspectives from educators, parents, and community facilitators.

The types of programs studied varied significantly, ranging from structured tutoring and literacy workshops to arts-based programs, sports clubs, and community mentorship schemes. While some interventions were single-focus (e.g., reading support), others adopted a holistic model integrating academic support with life skills development. Sample sizes also varied; quantitative studies typically included between 100 and 1,000 participants, while qualitative case studies often involved smaller cohorts of 10 to 30 individuals. A few large-scale evaluations, particularly those funded by NGOs or public-private partnerships, included national datasets spanning thousands of students. This diversity in scope and focus allowed for comparative insights across different forms of intervention, though it also introduced heterogeneity in outcome measurement and reporting.

3.2 Measured Outcomes and Evidence of Impact

Across the reviewed studies, academic outcomes were the most commonly measured indicators, with particular emphasis on improvements in literacy, numeracy, and overall grades. Many quantitative evaluations reported statistically significant gains in standardized test scores among students participating in community-based programs compared to control groups ^[29, 32]. These improvements were particularly notable in early literacy and foundational math skills, suggesting that even limited interventions can have meaningful effects when well-targeted. Additionally, some studies highlighted increased school attendance and reduced dropout rates among participants, linking engagement in extracurricular education to sustained school participation ^[30, 32].

In addition to academic metrics, numerous studies also measured social-emotional and behavioral outcomes. Improvements in self-esteem, self-regulation, interpersonal skills, and motivation to learn were consistently reported in qualitative research. These programs often provided safe and supportive environments where students could express themselves and develop a positive identity. Interactive and experiential learning methods, such as gamification, have been shown to foster motivation and social-emotional skills in educational contexts, supporting the positive impacts of community-based extracurricular programs on student engagement and development ^[41]. Several studies also observed reductions in negative behaviors such as aggression, absenteeism, and disengagement from school tasks. The presence of caring adult mentors and peer support systems within these programs was identified as a key contributing factor to these positive outcomes. Overall, the evidence indicates that community-based extracurricular education not only enhances academic performance but also nurtures the holistic development of students, especially in challenging school environments.

3.3 Strengths, Limitations, and Gaps in the Literature

One of the key strengths of the existing literature is the use of mixed-methods approaches, which allow for both quantitative validation and qualitative exploration of program

impacts. Many studies incorporate pre- and post-intervention assessments, focus groups, and interviews, providing a nuanced understanding of both outcomes and contextual factors. In addition, several evaluations were longitudinal, enabling insights into the sustained impact of extracurricular participation over time. Another strength lies in the international scope of research, which permits cross-contextual learning and adaptation of effective practices. However, there are notable limitations that temper the strength of conclusions. A common issue is the lack of randomized controlled trials, which reduces the ability to attribute causality between participation and outcomes. Furthermore, many studies rely on self-reported data from students or facilitators, which may be subject to bias. Inconsistent use of standardized outcome measures also complicates comparative analysis. Gaps in the literature include limited exploration of gender-specific impacts, insufficient attention to program sustainability, and a lack of studies examining the long-term economic or life-course outcomes of participation. These gaps highlight the need for more rigorous, theory-driven research that not only demonstrates effectiveness but also clarifies the mechanisms by which community-based extracurricular programs influence learning in underfunded settings.

4. Implementation Considerations

4.1 Community Involvement and Stakeholder Collaboration

Effective implementation of community-based extracurricular education depends heavily on the active involvement of various stakeholders, including parents, local organizations, and schools. Parental engagement not only improves attendance and continuity but also reinforces learning beyond the formal program environment^[31]. In many successful models, parents have taken roles as volunteers, co-facilitators, or cultural resource persons, helping to contextualize learning and ensure that it aligns with local values. Their participation fosters trust and enhances the legitimacy of the programs within the community^[32].

Local organizations—such as youth groups, religious institutions, and NGOs—play a pivotal role in the development and delivery of programs. These entities often provide physical space, skilled personnel, or funding and serve as bridges between the educational system and the wider community^[33]. Schools, while constrained in resources, contribute by identifying student needs, aligning extracurricular content with the academic curriculum, and supporting communication with families. When these stakeholders collaborate effectively, they form a cohesive support system that enhances both access and impact^[34].

4.2 Resource Constraints and Sustainability

Despite the promise of these initiatives, implementation is often hindered by chronic resource constraints. Funding remains the most persistent challenge, with many programs relying on short-term grants, philanthropic donations, or in-kind community contributions^[35, 40]. This precarious funding landscape limits scalability and can disrupt continuity, especially when donor priorities shift or economic conditions deteriorate. The lack of secure, long-term financing often forces organizations to limit the scope of activities or operate with minimal staff and outdated materials^[9, 36].

Another concern is the heavy reliance on volunteer labor,

which, while cost-effective, may lead to inconsistent program quality. Volunteers vary in expertise, and high turnover rates can compromise the stability and professionalism of instruction. Furthermore, burnout is common when workloads are high and recognition is low. To ensure long-term viability, programs must invest in volunteer training, provide modest incentives, and build partnerships with institutions that can offer structural support. Developing hybrid funding models—combining public, private, and community contributions—may also improve sustainability and resilience^[35, 37].

4.3 Policy and Program Design Implications

The insights gathered from the reviewed literature offer several implications for policy and program design. First, there is a clear need for policy frameworks that formally recognize and support the integration of community-based education into national education strategies. This includes allocating public resources for extracurricular programming, creating accreditation pathways for community educators, and encouraging schools to partner with local organizations. Policies that promote flexibility in curriculum design and funding use can empower communities to tailor programs to their specific needs^[38].

In terms of program design, emphasis should be placed on adaptability, cultural relevance, and alignment with local educational priorities. Programs that reflect local languages, traditions, and contexts are more likely to foster engagement and ownership^[39]. Additionally, establishing monitoring and evaluation mechanisms can improve accountability and facilitate learning across sites. Programs should also adopt a holistic approach that combines academic support with social-emotional development, ensuring comprehensive benefits for participants. Strategic planning, grounded in collaboration and informed by evidence, is essential for translating promising models into scalable, impactful interventions^[40, 41].

5. Conclusion

This systematic review has illuminated the significant role community-based extracurricular education can play in improving learning outcomes for students in underfunded schools. The evidence consistently shows that such programs, when properly implemented, lead to measurable gains in academic performance, enhanced social-emotional skills, and improved behavioral outcomes. The reviewed literature highlighted the diversity of program models, ranging from academic tutoring to arts and sports-based initiatives, all of which contributed to various dimensions of student development. These programs also offer students safe, stimulating environments where they can learn beyond the rigid confines of formal education.

Additionally, the analysis underscored the importance of collaborative implementation involving parents, community organizations, and educational institutions. Strong community engagement was repeatedly linked to program success, fostering greater trust, relevance, and sustainability. Although resource limitations and inconsistent evaluation methodologies were identified as challenges, the overarching trend across studies affirmed the potential of community-rooted interventions to supplement and enrich learning in settings where formal education often falls short.

While the current body of research presents promising results, several areas warrant further exploration to

strengthen the evidence base and guide future program development. There is a pressing need for more rigorous, longitudinal studies that can assess the long-term impact of community-based extracurricular participation on academic achievement, career readiness, and life trajectories. Randomized controlled trials, where feasible, would enhance the causal validity of findings and help establish clearer benchmarks for program success. Additionally, comparative studies across different cultural and regional contexts could provide insights into which program features are most universally effective versus those that require local adaptation.

Another important area for future research lies in understanding differential impacts by gender, socioeconomic background, and disability status. These analyses can inform inclusive design strategies and ensure that interventions are equitably beneficial. There is also scope for research into the internal mechanisms of successful programs—examining factors like mentor quality, curriculum design, and learner engagement—that drive positive outcomes. A deeper investigation into cost-effectiveness and sustainability models would further support evidence-based decision-making by practitioners and policymakers alike.

Community-based extracurricular education emerges from this review not as a peripheral add-on but as a potentially transformative strategy for advancing educational equity. In underfunded school contexts, where systemic constraints often limit the reach and quality of traditional teaching, these programs offer an alternative pathway to holistic development. By mobilizing local knowledge, fostering relational learning, and tailoring activities to students' lived realities, such interventions bridge critical gaps in both academic support and personal growth opportunities.

Ultimately, the value of these programs lies not only in their ability to raise test scores but also in their power to inspire confidence, cultivate aspirations, and reconnect students with the joy of learning. As education systems worldwide grapple with widening disparities, embracing community-driven, extracurricular approaches represents a meaningful step toward leveling the playing field. To fully realize their potential, stakeholders must continue to invest in inclusive, evidence-informed models that place learners—and their communities—at the center of educational transformation.

6. References

- Gorski PC. Reaching and teaching students in poverty: Strategies for erasing the opportunity gap. New York: Teachers College Press; 2017.
- Abisoye A, Akerele JI, Odio PE, Collins A, Babatunde GO, Mustapha SD. A Data-Driven Approach to Strengthening Cybersecurity Policies in Government Agencies: Best Practices and Case Studies. *Int J Cybersecurity Policy Stud.* (Pending publication).
- Ajala OA, Soladoye DA. Introducing the Principles of Cybersecurity, Artificial Intelligence, and IoT Applications into the STEM Curriculum to Enhance Students' Hands-on Learning, Conducting Real-World Case Studies and Project-Based Assessments is truly a Novel and Sensational Approach.
- Alonge EO, Eyo-Udo NL, Ubanadu BC, Daraojimba AI, Balogun ED, Ogunsola KO. Enhancing Data Security with Machine Learning: A Study on Fraud Detection Algorithms. *J Data Secur Fraud Prev.* 2021;7(2):105-118.
- Mayienga BA, *et al.* Studying the transformation of consumer retail experience through virtual reality technologies.
- Attipoe V, Oyeyipo I, Ayodeji DC, Isibor NJ, Apiyo B. Economic Impacts of Employee Well-being Programs: A Review.
- Isibor NJ, Attipoe V, Oyeyipo I, Ayodeji DC, Apiyo B. Proposing Innovative Human Resource Policies for Enhancing Workplace Diversity and Inclusion.
- Alonge EO, Eyo-Udo NL, Ubanadu BC, Daraojimba AI, Balogun ED, Ogunsola KO. Integrated framework for enhancing sales enablement through advanced CRM and analytics solutions.
- Apelehin AA, *et al.* Reviewing the Role of Artificial Intelligence in Personalized Learning and Education.
- Simac J, Marcus R, Harper C. Does non-formal education have lasting effects? *Compare.* 2021;51(5):706-724.
- Olibie EI, Ifeoma M. Curriculum enrichment for 21st-century skills: A case for arts-based extracurricular activities for students. *Int J Recent Sci Res.* 2015;6(1):4850-4856.
- Ozobu CO, Adikwu FE, Cynthia OO, Onyeke FO, Nwulu EO. Advancing Occupational Safety with AI-Powered Monitoring Systems: A Conceptual Framework for Hazard Detection and Exposure Control.
- Martinez A, Coker C, McMahon SD, Cohen J, Thapa A. Involvement in extracurricular activities: Identifying differences in perceptions of school climate. *Educ Dev Psychol.* 2016;33(1):70-84.
- Isibor NJ, Attipoe V, Oyeyipo I, Ayodeji DC, Apiyo B. Analyzing Successful Content Marketing Strategies That Enhance Online Engagement and Sales for Digital Brands.
- Mayienga BA, *et al.* A Conceptual Model for Global Risk Management, Compliance, and Financial Governance in Multinational Corporations.
- Karunakar B. Benefits of co-curricular and extracurricular activities to the marginalized children: Social welfare residential educational institutions. *Educ Quest.* 2020;11(2):43-51.
- Oyeyipo I, *et al.* A Conceptual Framework for Transforming Corporate Finance Through Strategic Growth, Profitability, and Risk Optimization.
- Oyeyipo I, *et al.* Investigating the effectiveness of microlearning approaches in corporate training programs for skill enhancement.
- Zavershneva E, van der Veer R. Lev Vygotsky. In: *Encyclopedia of evolutionary psychological science.* Springer; 2021. p. 4539-4542.
- O'Connell C. Learning as a shared process: Vygotsky and the socio-cultural theories of learning. In: *Psychology and the Study of Education.* Routledge; 2018. p. 161-176.
- Perron N. Bronfenbrenner's ecological systems theory. *Coll Stud Dev.* 2017;197(23):1-10.
- Crawford M. Ecological Systems theory: Exploring the development of the theoretical framework as conceived by Bronfenbrenner. *J Pub Health Issue Pract.* 2020;4(2):170.
- Rus AV, *et al.* Bronfenbrenner's ecological system theory and the experience of institutionalization of Romanian children. In: *New approaches in behavioral sciences.* 2020. p. 237-251.

24. Sitzer B. Student engagement in low-income, high-stress learning environments. 2020.
25. Gorski KJ. In school for after school: The relationship between extracurricular participation and school engagement. *Sociol Forum*. 2021;36(1):248-270.
26. Christensen KM. A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis of the Effects of After-School Programs on Academic, Social, Behavioral, Mental Health, and Identity Outcomes Among Youth With Marginalized Identities. University of Massachusetts Boston; 2021.
27. Stefanski A, Valli L, Jacobson R. Beyond Involvement and Engagement: The Role of the Family in School-Community Partnerships. *Sch Community J*. 2016;26(2):135-160.
28. Grant KB, Ray JA. Home, school, and community collaboration: Culturally responsive family engagement. Sage Publications; 2018.
29. Disler R, Glenister K, Wright J. Rural chronic disease research patterns in the United Kingdom, United States, Canada, Australia and New Zealand: a systematic integrative review. *BMC Public Health*. 2020;20:1-7.
30. Mooldijk SS, Licher S, Wolters FJ. Characterizing demographic, racial, and geographic diversity in dementia research: a systematic review. *JAMA Neurol*. 2021;78(10):1255-1261.
31. Chicoski LK. Youth involvement in extracurricular activities: Perceptions of stakeholders in a school-based leadership program. Southern Connecticut State University; 2015.
32. Heers M, Van Klaveren C, Groot W, Maassen van den Brink H. Community schools: What we know and what we need to know. *Rev Educ Res*. 2016;86(4):1016-1051.
33. Taylor L. The role of non-governmental organizations in global education: a case study on Sub-Saharan Africa. 2019.
34. Lewis D, Kanji N, Themudo NS. Non-governmental organizations and development. Routledge; 2020.
35. Caballero RJ, Farhi E, Gourinchas P-O. The safe assets shortage conundrum. *J Econ Perspect*. 2017;31(3):29-46.
36. Levine CH. Organizational decline and cutback management. In: *Public sector performance*. Routledge; 2018. p. 230-249.
37. Powell M, Gillett A, Doherty B. Sustainability in social enterprise: hybrid organizing in public services. *Public Manag Rev*. 2019;21(2):159-186.
38. Viennet R, Pont B. Education policy implementation: A literature review and proposed framework. 2017.
39. Shonfeld M, *et al*. Learning in digital environments: a model for cross-cultural alignment. *Educ Technol Res Dev*. 2021;1-20.
40. Norris JM. Language program evaluation. *Mod Lang J*. 2016;100(S1):169-189.
41. Tasleem N, Raghav RS, Gangadharan S. Gamification Strategies for Career Development: Boosting Professional Growth and Engagement with Interactive Progress Tracking. 2020.